#### Office of Legislative Auditor General



WILLIE MAYO, CPA, CIA, CICA AUDITOR GENERAL

May 4, 2012

500 GRISWOLD STREET STE. 848; GUARDIAN BLDG. DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226 TELEPHONE: (313) 224-0924

#### FINAL REPORT TRANSMITTAL LETTER

Honorable Wayne County Commissioners:

Enclosed is the final copy of the Corrective Action Plan (CAP) and Auditor General's Assessment for the Operational Assessment Review on Wayne County Land Bank Corporation, dated November 21, 2011. Our report is dated March 30, 2012; DAP No. 2012-57-850. The report was accepted by the Audit Committee April 24, 2012, and formally received by the Wayne County Commission on May 3, 2012.

We are pleased to inform you officials from Wayne County Land Bank Corporation provided their full cooperation. If you have any questions, concerns, or desire to discuss the report in greater detail, we would be happy to do so at your convenience. This report is intended for your information and should not be used for any other purpose. Copies of all Office of Legislative Auditor General's final reports can be found on our website at: <a href="http://www.waynecounty.com/commission/lagreports.htm">http://www.waynecounty.com/commission/lagreports.htm</a>

o, CPA, CIA, CGAP, CICA peral

Auditor General

#### REPORT DISTRIBUTION

Wayne County Treasurer

Honorable Raymond J. Wojtowicz, Chairperson, Wayne County Land Bank Corporation

**Wayne County Land Bank Corporation** 

Jeanne Hanna, Executive Director

Department of Management & Budget

Carla E. Sledge, Chief Financial Officer
Terry L. Hasse, Director, Grants Compliance and Contract Management
Melinda G. Haner, Finance and Compliance Manager

**Wayne County Executive** 



#### Office of Legislatibe Auditor General



WILLIE MAYO, CPA, CIA, CICA AUDITOR GENERAL 500 GRISWOLD STREET STE. 848; GUARDIAN BLDG. DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226 TELEPHONE: (313) 224-0924

March 30, 2012

DAP No. 2012-57-850

Honorable Ilona Varga, Chairwoman Audit Committee Wayne County Commission County of Wayne, Michigan 500 Griswold Ave., Suite 766 Detroit, MI 48226

Subject:

Corrective Action Plan, including the Auditor General's Assessment, dated March 30, 2012 for the Wayne County Land Bank Corporation, Operational Assessment Review.

#### Dear Chairwoman Varga:

In accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors, the Office of Legislative Auditor General (OAG) requested the Wayne County Land Bank Corporation to submit a Corrective Action Plan (CAP) for multiple recommendations identified in the Operational Assessment Review engagement dated November 21, 2011.

Wayne County Land Bank Corporation provided the CAP as requested. Attached is a Summary and Assessment of the CAP prepared by the OAG with thirteen (13) recommendations. The summary schedule includes: the recommendations; management's comments on the findings and recommendations; management's action taken or planned; whether management has or intends to implement the recommendations; responsible person(s)/area; implementation or targeted implementation date; and, the Auditor General's assessment.

Our assessment of the CAP indicated that the Wayne County Land Bank Corporation has taken sufficient action to address three (3) recommendations identified in the report. However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future on ten (10) recommendations to ensure that the intended action addresses the recommendation.



Honorable Ilona Varga DAP No. 2012-57-850 March 30, 2012 Page 2 of 2

Respectfully submitted,

Willie Mayo, CPA, CIA, COAP, CICA

Auditor General

Pc: Jeanne Hanna, Executive Director, WCLB

Honorable Raymond J. Wojtowicz, Chairman, WCLB Board

Carla E. Sledge, Chief Financial Officer, M&B

Terry L. Hasse, Director, Grants Compliance and Contract Management

Melinda Haner, Finance & Compliance Manager

Attachment

#### Recommendations Management's Comments on Findings and Agree Agree **Operational Assessment Review Engagement Report** reached out to the WCLB WCLB Management working with the Board this item be placed on the with a recommendation that Board in November 2011 (WCLB) Management is to outline land bank County Treasurer's Office Chair and the Wayne Management is also financial reporting requirements. WCLB researching other similar Wayne County Land Bank define operational and land bank policies that **Action Taken or Planned** Management's Wayne County Land Bank Corporation CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN Summary and Assessment of rights or authority to alter the WCLB has no voting Executive Director the powers outlined in the The Executive Director of Intends to Implement the recommendations born out WCLB Board members of a proper review and further discussion with Management has or Recommendation Yes/No Yes, based on the

Management and Finance

Board, WCLB

Within the Next

During our review and

30-60 days

Director

Responsible Person(s)/

Area

Implementation

Auditor General's Assessment

Targeted

mplementation

10-01

In the interest of

transparency and

objectivity, we recommend

Auditor General's

Recommendation

#### Wayne County Office of Legislative Auditor General DAP No. 2012-57-850

authority to deed land to a only the Board the board members, and allow

expressed a strong desire to

guidelines approved by the

will carry out his/her duties in accordance with the

meeting to discuss the

agenda for the next upcoming has placed the item on the WCLB Executive Director We also confirmed that the

recommendation.

pleasure of the Board and Director serves at the Resolution. The Executive

WCLB Board

Board's decision.

powers outlined by the Board or authority to alter the Director has no voting rights

immediately after

Effective

We agree that the Executive

described action has occurred future to verify that the may be necessary in the near

address the recommendation. action appears to sufficiently

However, a follow-up review

implemented as described, the

Based on a limited review, if

the planned action is

for transparency purposes. Directors on a quarterly basis

the activities to the Board of

provide a quarterly report on for the current fiscal year, and and performance objectives provide a set of written goals Bank Board of Directors to collaborating with the Land WCLB is in the process of inquiry, we confirmed that

the WCLB

meeting (March 2012). The

agenda for the next Board

Chair of the Board

increase the number of Executive Director, expenditures by the for the approval of

developer(s)

10-02

and reporting on the performance objectives work with management on

discussion, as well as,

Directors for review and

establishing annual

and present to the Board of

approved by management

transactions initiated and

quarterly report of all

Executive Director make a the Board require the

Board review the threshold We recommend the WCLB

described, the action will action is implemented as

Therefore, if the planned

10-03 We recommend the Board require the Executive Director to establish a policy that requires WCLB Management to formally report all operational and financial activity to them on a monthly or quarterly basis		Auditor General's Recommendation
Agree		Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations
WCLB Management is reviewing the establishment of formal reporting requirements. WCLB Management believes this will coincide with the development of the action for recommendation 10-01.		Management's Action Taken or Planned
Yes, based on the recommendations born out of a proper review.		Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation Yes/No
WCLB Board, Management and Finance Director.		Responsible Person(s)/ Area
Within the Next 30-60 days		Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date
We confirmed that WCLB Management is in the process of implementing a policy which requires WCLB Management to formally report all operational activities and financial activity to the Board of Directors on a quarterly basis.  Based on our limited review, if the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently address the recommendation. However, follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.	appear to sufficiently address the recommendation. However, follow-up may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.	Auditor General's Assessment

#### Operational Assessment Review Engagement Report Wayne County Land Bank Corporation

#### CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN Summary and Assessment of

10-05	11-04	m A
Wayne County Land Bank Management review and enhance the policies and procedures related to the procurement of goods and services that was adopted by the Board of Directors on December 18, 2007.	The WCLB should develop and implement a comprehensive, formalized (written) policies and procedures manual for all key functions of the division. The manual should clearly outline the specific duties, authority, and responsibility for all employees, thus providing the essential foundation needed for establishing employee accountability and management oversight.	Auditor General's Recommendation
Agree	Agree	Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations
WCLB Management concurs and has begun reviewing other procurement policies and procedures for best practices. WCLB Management has also had preliminary conversations with the Wayne County Director of Purchasing as well as Corporation Counsel.	The WCLB is completing the development of a policies and procedures manual for employee duties and responsibilities.	Management's Action Taken or Planned
Yes	Yes	Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation Yes/No
WCLB Management and WCLB Board.	WCLB Management and Team.	Responsible Person(s)/ Area
Within the next 180 days.	Within the Next 30-60 days	Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date
We confirmed that WCLB Management is currently working in collaboration with the Purchasing Division and Corporation Counsel to revise their current policies and procedures on procurement. If the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently address the recommendation.	We noted that WCLB has two (2) active programs: TURBO and Project Saved. We were able to confirm WCLB management has completed a comprehensive set of formalized policies and procedures for Project Saved which we were able to review. They appear to be thorough and complete. However, the policies and procedures for TURBO are currently in the process of being written.  If the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently address the recommendation. However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.	Auditor General's Assessment

				4.12 and 4.13 Ethics and Conflicts of Interest – The			
				4.11 Executive Director – WCLB Management and Corporation Counsel has complied with this provision.			
address the recommendation. However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.				Board Responsibilities – The WCLB concurs that it does not currently have specific written policies for its day-to-day operations.			
are met.  If the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently	next 90 days.	ā		4.01 County Land Bank Board Composition – The WCLB has always been in full compliance with this provision.	,		
vital policies, ordinances, and regulations. In addition, management is in the process of implementing a policy on ensuring that aspects of the	As to 4.07, WCLB Management and Team has completed a draft and is working to			As it relates to the specific sections outlined in the Audit Report:		Intergovernmental Agreement are met.	
During our inquiry and review, we confirmed that WCLB Management has compiled a comprehensive set of legal references and policies to better reference	The WCLB is in compliance with sections 4.01, 4.11, 4.12, 4.13, and 7.08.	WCLB Management and WCLB Board.	Yes	The WCLB Team has completed the compilation of a corporate binder as well as a legal reference guide in order to better reference relevant policies.	Agree	We recommend WCLB Management establish the appropriate policies, procedures, and controls to ensure the requirements within the	10-06
However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.							
Auditor General's Assessment	Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date	Responsible Person(s)/ Area	Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation Yes/No	Management's Action Taken or Planned	Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations	Auditor General's Recommendation	

## Wayne County Land Bank Corporation Operational Assessment Review Engagement Report

We recommend WCLB develop a formal, written policy and procedure statement outlining the required compliance and regulation processes. In addition, this policy and procedure statement should incorporate all requirements listed in the Enrolled Ordinance, certain requirements as specified in the Intergovernmental Agreement and any other governing documents associated with the operation of the WCLB.	Auditor General's Recommendation
Agree	Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations
with this provision. WCLB Management is reviewing the newly introduced Wayne County ethics policy as well.  7.08 Performance Objectives – The WCLB Management has been in compliance with this provision.  WCLB Management relies on and remains compliant with the policies and procedures set forth in the Land Bank related legislation. WCLB Management is looking into the best way in which to stay apprised of other compliance requirements outside of those set forth in the Land Bank related legislation.	Management's Action Taken or Planned WCLB is in compliance
Yes	Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation Yes/No
WCLB Management and Team	Responsible Person(s)/ Area
Within the Next 60-90 days	Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date
During our inquiry, we confirmed WCLB  Management is in the process of establishing a written detailed policy and procedure on the process of complying with the requirements of the Enrolled Ordinance.  If the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently address the recommendation. However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.	Auditor General's Assessment

## Wayne County Land Bank Corporation Operational Assessment Review Engagement Report

10-09		10-08	
We recommend adopting a corporation-wide policy that requires detailed job descriptions for each employment position be maintained on file and that they are uniform, reviewed periodically, and in accordance with the Wayne County Personnel policy.		We recommend that the WCLB formally develop guidelines and adhere to the criteria identified in their program descriptions, to provide equal and fair opportunity to all developers seeking the services of the WCLB.	Auditor General's Recommendation
Agree	*	Agree	Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations
WCLB Management has developed formal job descriptions and duties for personnel assigned to the WCLB.		WCLB Management has held four brainstorming sessions to address the desire to provide guidelines for various programs. An initial draft of guidelines has been circulated internally and is under review.	Management's Action Taken or Planned
		as v	
Yes		Yes	Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation Yes/No
WCLB Management		WCLB Management	Responsible Person(s)/ Area
Within the Next 60-90 days.		Within the next 60-90 days.	Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date
During our review, WCLB provided detailed uniform job descriptions on each full-time position held within WCLB. However, management is in the process of implementing a policy which requires Wayne County Land Bank's Executive Director to review all job descriptions annually in accordance with the Equal and Fair Employment Opportunity Act.	If the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently address the recommendation. However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.	WCLB has two active programs: TURBO and Project Saved. We were able to confirm WCLB  Management is working to develop guidelines for their programs. We obtained and reviewed a comprehensive set of formalized policies and procedures for Project Saved. However, the policies and procedures for TURBO are currently in the process of being written.	Auditor General's Assessment

## Wayne County Land Bank Corporation Operational Assessment Review Engagement Report

cstablish procedures to retain copies of the County's annual disclosure form, along with transmittal within the corporation in order to demonstrate compliance with this critical provision of the procurement ordinance; as well as establish controls to ensure that all potential conflicts of interest are being disclosed annually.		Auditor General's Recommendation
Agree		Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations
When this Ordinance became effective in June 2011, WCLB Management began maintaining the Annual Conflict of Interest Disclosure Statements in accordance with the amendment.		Management's Action Taken or Planned
Yes		Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation Yes/No
WCLB Management		Responsible Person(s)/ Area
Implemented		Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date
We confirmed that WCLB Management is in the process of establishing a policy on maintaining copies of the Annual Conflict of Interest Disclosure Form in accordance with the procurement ordinance. In addition at the next WCLB Board meeting the Annual Conflict of Interest Disclosure Statements will be updated for 2012.  If the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently address the recommendation. However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.	If the planned action is implemented as described, the action appears to sufficiently address the recommendation. However, a follow-up review may be necessary in the near future to verify that the described action has occurred.	Auditor General's Assessment

10-12	10-11	
In an effort to enhance the integrity of financial reporting throughout the fiscal year, we recommend the Wayne County Land Bank adjust their budget to properly reflect actual costs being incurred, and because of budget constraints institute programs to make this entity self sustaining.	We recommend that all legal contracts procured for the benefit of WCLB be stated in the title and body of the contract so that it is clear who are legally bound to fulfill the terms of the contract.	Auditor General's Recommendation
Agree	Agree	Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations
The new Finance Director for the WCLB has already put in place a corrective action plan. The Finance Director expects the audit recommendations to be resolved in the FY 10/11 audit.	This was corrected in 2010 and all legal service contracts reflect this change and identify the Wayne County Land Bank as the contracting entity. The WCLB is in compliance with section 4.07 of the Intergovernmental Agreement.	Management's Action Taken or Planned
Yes	Yes	Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation Yes/No
WCLB Finance Director	Corporation Counsel and WCLB Management	Responsible Person(s)/ Area
Implemented	Implemented	Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date
During our review of the WCLB Financial Statements, we identified that our prior year recommendation of amending the budget was addressed and corrective action has been taken.  Therefore, based on the limited review of the action taken, management appears to have taken sufficient action to address the recommendation.	We confirmed that WCLB Management has revised the contract language to identify the Wayne County Land Bank Corporation as the contracting entity in the title and body of the contract.  Based on the limited review of the action taken, management appears to have taken sufficient action to address the recommendation.	Auditor General's Assessment

		10-13	
	establishing a joint land bank board similar to the Wayne County - Detroit Community Mental Health Board with the City of Detroit.	Since approximately 90% of all properties being held in the WCLB inventory are located in Detroit, WCLB Management should take the lead and consider	Auditor General's Recommendation
		Agree	Management's Comments on Findings and Recommendations
	Management intends to continue to foster these and other relationships.	WCLB Management maintains a very good working relationship with City of Detroit Lank Bank and the State Land Bank Authority. WCLB	Management's Action Taken or Planned
		Yes	Management has or Intends to Implement the Recommendation
	2	WCLB Management	Responsible Person(s)/ Area
	Authority for over 2 years.	WCLB Management has been working with the City of Detroit Land Bank and the State Land Bank	Implementation or Targeted Implementation Date
Based on the limited review of the action taken, management appears to have taken sufficient action to address the recommendation.	Management has established a compensating control to formally work together with the City of Detroit to enhance the programs and operations of WCLB.	We confirmed that WCLB Management does not have the authority to establish a joint land bank board with the City of Detroit Land Bank. However, WCLB	Auditor General's Assessment