



Office of the County Clerk

Elections Division

Cathy M. Garrett
Wayne County Clerk

June 12, 2026

STAFF REPORT (REVIEW OF NOMINATING PETITIONS)

Susan L. Hubbard
Candidate for Judge of Probate Court – Wayne County – Non-Incumbent Position

NUMBER OF VALID SIGNATURES REQUIRED: 4,000 signatures

TOTAL FILING: 5,494 signatures submitted (maximum number allowed 8,000)

RESULTS OF FACIAL REVIEW:	5,494 signatures
Incomplete or Improper Headers	- 10
Incomplete or Improper Circulator Certificate	- 0
Incomplete or missing signatures	- 0
Incomplete or missing date of signing	- 22
Incomplete address or improper jurisdiction	- 1

Total number of reviewable signatures: **5,461 signatures**

ANALYSIS OF CHALLENGE

TOTAL NUMBER OF SIGNATURES QUESTIONED UNDER CHALLENGE: As a result of the challenge filed by John M. Chase III, 1,592 signatures are at issue. After a facial review, candidate Hubbard had a cushion of 1,461 signatures. Because the number of signatures challenged exceeded Hubbard's cushion, staff began to process the challenge.

Staff review of the challenges submitted by John M. Chase III and provides the following staff report of its findings:

The challenger alleges through his sworn complaint and brief in support of his complaint, that candidate Hubbard has failed to submit the required number of valid signatures. The challenger also alleges that nominating petitions certified by circulator "Maliek Phillips" show considerable signature fraud by himself or in conjunction with other unknown individuals to affix signatures on petitions that are not the actual signatures of the purported individual whose name and address appears opposite the signature. He alleges similar styles of writing and printing, repetition of first and last names, symmetry of information lining up with signatories, and the volume of signatures are all hallmarks of fraudulent behavior.



Candidate Hubbard filed a response on May 5, 2026, denying the claims and identifying the challenger as the campaign fundraiser for Judge of Probate candidate Sarah Colegrove. Candidate Hubbard claims the challenger relied on another challenger's (Matthew Wilk), "automated 'Artificial Intelligence' flawed qualified voter program" and alleges that the system is characterized by a distinct pattern of systemic errors. She further claims the program does not take into account instances where the penmanship of the signor was not legible, and a system failure rate among individuals with unique or uncommon names.

Challenger Chase identified 75 petition sheets in his challenge as sheets containing patterns of fraudulent behavior. County Clerk staff reviewed the entirety of the petition filing and identified approximately 104 sheets, containing 973 petition signatures that appear to be forged or fraudulently signed by a person or persons not purported to be the petition signer. Multiple staff members report issues with the petition signatures contained on petitions circulated by "Maliek Phillips" residing at 1935 Chene Court, Detroit, MI 48207.

A voter registration check of the QVF produces a challenged registration record for Maliek Alexander-Jonda Phillips at 3520 E. Jefferson, Detroit, MI 48207. Of the petitions submitted by circulator Phillips, the pattern of fraud includes same and similar handwriting, signatures obtained by signers with the frequently used last names of King, Walker, Battles, Styles, Smith, Peoples, Kirk, Gordon, Jenkins, and Harris.

While the presence of common names is not an alarm on their own, it is the presence of the same last names with the same or similar handwriting on multiple petitions sheets that did not match or bear a resemblance to the voter's signature in the QVF. Petitions sheets 30, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, and 46 almost entirely indicate signatures with the same or similar handwriting from signers with the last name of King, Smith, Styles, Walker, Kirk, Carl, or Carlton.

These irregularities along with the review of the challenged signatures caused staff to review all signatures obtained by circulator Phillips. Staff noticed misspellings of printed names, street names, omission of the signer's last name on the petition, and signers not registered or registered at the address on the petition. When a signer is not registered at the address listed on the petition, staff relies on the signature on the petition to assist with identifying the signer in QVF. For example, petition page 289 line 3, 4, 5, 8, 9, and 10 all contain the voter's first and middle name, with the last name omitted. This pattern continues throughout the petitions circulated by Phillips. Same or similar flourishes, slants, distinctive letters of "J", "W", "L", "K", and lowercase "f" appear repeatedly.

For these reasons stated above the 104 petition sheets containing approximately 973 signatures submitted by circulator "Maliek Phillips" are **disqualified** from consideration. (A full list of the disqualified petitions and the number of signatures for each petition is attached.) County Clerk staff recommends the petitions purported to be circulated by circulator "Maliek Phillips" residing at 1935 Chene Court, Detroit, MI 48207 or 3520 E. Jefferson, Detroit, MI 48207, be referred to the Michigan Secretary of State's Office

and/or the Attorney General's departmental Office of Investigative Services (OIS) for a full and complete investigation for forgery and fraud.

To process the remainder of the challenge, staff calculated the balance of challenged signatures that remain eligible for review. Of the 1,592 signature challenges, challenge to sheet 400, line 5 was listed twice, reducing the number of challenges to 1,591. 459 challenged signatures overlapped with the disqualified signatures, reducing the number of challenged signatures for review to 1,132.

13 overlapping challenges for invalid date, address, or header errors, 339 challenges recommended to be upheld, 490 challenges recommended to be rejected, 136 challenges with miscellaneous identifying issues, 40 signature errors, and 114 duplicates.

RESULTS OF PETITION CHALLENGE:

	5,461
	- 973 (Disqualified)
	4,488 (reviewable signatures)
Not Registered/Not Registered in District	- 339
Duplicates	- 114
Signature Errors/Miscellaneous Identifying issues	<u>- 176</u>
Total Number of Valid Signatures	3,859

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Determine petition insufficient.